

Note: this paper was written under the guidance of Professor Michael Fotos in his Democracy and Sustainability Course at Yale University

Emily Horgen
9 December, 2022

Applying Ostrom's Institutional Analysis and Development Framework to Natural Gas Allocation in Germany

Policy Analysis Objective

Using Elinor Ostrom's Institutional Analysis and Development Framework and through researching legislation that has been implemented in response to the War in Ukraine, I plan to study *how* decisions are made about natural gas allocation in Germany.

Action Situation:

In the Action Situation, both the European Union and the German government pass legislation. The European Union's main natural gas policy is REGULATION (EU) 2017/1938, which was passed in 2017 ("REGULATION (EU) 2017/1938"). This regulation creates a natural gas crisis plan that each member state must follow, and it encompasses three phases ("REGULATION (EU) 2017/1938," 657). The first phase is an early warning phase, when there is a significant change of gas supply. The second phase is an alert level phase, when a disruption has occurred but the market "manages the disruption." Finally, the last phase is an emergency level, when the market is no longer able to manage the disruption ("REGULATION (EU) 2017/1938," 657).

Germany can both follow E.U. legislation and create its own policies. To create its own policies, Germany passes laws through parliament, otherwise known as the Bundestag ("Legislation"). The Bundestag, along with the Federal President and Federal Chancellor must approve a bill in order for it to pass ("Legislation").

Policy Outcome: Regulations Passed in Response to the War in Ukraine

On the domestic scale, Germany created a three-step natural gas crisis plan based on REGULATION (EU) 2017/1938, which is overseen by the German Ministry of Economic Affairs and Climate Action (Stuart). In late March, 2022, Germany entered phase 1 of its crisis plan, and in late June, 2022, Germany entered phase 2 of its crisis plan (“Germany enters Phase 2 of Emergency Gas Plan”).

In theory, phase 2 of the E.U.-based crisis plan would allow suppliers to transfer soaring energy costs to consumers, disproportionately affecting vulnerable consumers and industries - like the energy intensive automobile industry (Hansen; Stuart). However, in practice, the Ministry of Economic Affairs and Climate Action did not enact this clause and instead distributed costs among all types of consumers through a “solidarity levy” (Stuart; “Factbox: The three stages”). The levy revenue helps natural gas suppliers purchase more expensive natural gas from non-Russian sources (“Factbox: The three stages”).

As the Ministry of Economic Affairs and Climate Action progresses the nation through the 3-phase natural gas crisis plan, German Chancellor Olaf Scholz and the German parliament create additional natural gas policies. In September, 2022, President Scholz signed a 200 billion Euro plan to reduce the burden of rising energy costs, which will take effect in December, 2022 (Hill). Germany will use this funding to help consumers and small businesses pay for monthly gas bills (Hill). Through this 200 billion Euro plan, Germany will also cap energy prices for 80% of consumer gas consumption and 70% of total consumer electricity consumption (Hill). Finally, through this bill Germany will pay natural gas providers the difference between the true value of gas and what the consumers can pay (Von der Burchard).

On a larger scale, the European Union Commission has also implemented legislation that affects German natural gas allocation. One important piece of legislation is the REPowerEU

plan, which was ratified in May, 2022 (“Communication from the Commission”). This plan aims to reduce E.U. dependency on Russia, and it does so by sanctioning Russia, encouraging energy saving, promoting energy diversification, and transferring energy away from fossil fuels (Communication from the Commission”). Germany strives to adhere to REPowerEU’s mission of energy saving by creating a natural gas saving auction system (“EU asks countries”).

5. Integrate the analysis

Action Situation: Germany’s Payoff Structure (Costs and Benefits)

Germany is incentivized, arguably more so than other E.U. countries, to follow REGULATION (EU) 2017/1938 due to its dependence on Russian natural gas: more than half (55%) of Germany’s natural gas was imported from Russia (Moll). By following the European Union’s REGULATION (EU) 2017/1938, Germany enjoys certain benefits. For example, Germany can receive financial assistance from the Security of Supply Coordination Group (REGULATION, EU, 646).

If Germany were to stray from REGULATION (EU) 2017/1938 and refuse to create a natural gas crisis plan, Germany would be held accountable by the Energy Community. The Energy Community, which was created in 2005, is an independent organization that is larger than the E.U. (it includes nearby countries like Albania) and has a more specific focus than the E.U. (it only regulates energy markets) (“Who we are”; “Energy Community”). The Energy Community Secretariat has the power to regulate energy technology, energy transportation, energy provision, and energy crisis management (“The Energy Community Treaty”). The Energy Community can revoke voting rights in Energy Community meeting from a country that does not abide by REGULATION (EU) 2017/1938 (REGULATION (EU) 2017/1938, 651). This would be an undesirable outcome for Germany because Energy Community Decisions can impact domestic natural gas provision.

Action Situation: Positions and Authority

Positions within Germany include the 598 German Parliament members, the Council of the European Union Members, the German Chancellor, and the German Federal Minister of Economic Affairs and Climate Action (“German Elections”; “Dr. Robert Habeck”). Olaf Scholz serves as the German Chancellor, and Robert Habeck serves as the German Federal Minister of Economic Affairs and Climate Action (“Dr. Robert Habeck”).

The E.U. is divided into the European Council, the European Commission, the European Parliament, and the Council of the European Union (not to be confused with the European Council) (“How priorities are set”). The European Council is composed of the leaders of all 27 E.U. member states (“How priorities are set”). The European Commission is composed of one commissioner from each E.U. country and the President of the European Commission, Ursula von der Leyen (“European Commission”; “The Commissioners”). The Council of the European Union includes the minister from each country who covers the policy area in question (“Council of the European Union”). Since E.U. legislative bodies incorporate leaders from different countries, E.U. decisions reflect the interests of the entire European Union.

Action Situation: Actions of Participants and Policy Outcomes

German leaders who affect natural gas allocation are selected by German citizens. Citizens can vote in the general election to determine Federal Parliament members (German elections), and Federal parliament members in turn affect the election of the German Chancellor (German elections).

The German government can create policies that are not directly outlined in E.U. legislation. For example, German Chancellor Olaf Scholz created a domestic 200-billion-Euro relief plan to households and industries, which had no basis in European Union guidelines

(Hansen). The German government can also suggest policies to the European Union Council (“How priorities are set”). In late October, 2022, Chancellor Scholz acted on his power to propose legislation. He suggested that E.U. countries partner with nations that could house natural gas fields, such as Senegal (“Germany wants EU”). The European Union heeded Scholz’ suggestions, and in their European Council Conclusions statement released on October, 20, 2022, the E.U. encouraged multinational energy partnerships to increase energy access (“European Council Conclusions”).

In the same way that Germany can affect E.U. policies, the E.U. can also affect German natural gas policies. The President of the European Commission proposes legislation by giving an annual “State of the Union” speech to the European Parliament (“How priorities are set”). Next, the European Council weighs in on this suggested legislation (“How priorities are set”). The European Parliament and the Council of the European Union negotiate and adopt the proposed legislation. The European Parliament votes on policies that were suggested by the “State of the “Union Speech” (“How priorities are set”). Next, the Parliament creates a year-long plan of action (“How priorities are set”). For this legislative plan to take effect, it must also be approved by the Council of the European Union (“Legislative Powers”). The Council of the European Union requires a qualified majority vote (55%), which is equivalent to the support of roughly 15 countries (“Council of the European Union”).

In 2019, The President of the European Commission, Ursula von der Leyen, acted upon her ability to publish policy priorities in a “State of the Union Speech.” She proposed her 6 policy priorities, and the European Parliament focused primarily on Leyen’s “climate-neutral” goal to create their action plan (“Commission adopts its Work Programme”). To achieve carbon neutrality, the plan suggests a decoupling of electricity and gas prices, incentivising natural gas

saving by prohibiting companies from profiting from selling more gas (“Commission adopts its Work Programme”; “Utility Decoupling”). While these E.U.-wide energy goals will likely help Germany reduce its dependence on natural gas, Germany seems to prefer the flexibility of domestic policy to E.U.-wide legislation, which is apparent in the discussion of actor’s valuations.

Actors: Valuations

Valuations are the goals of participants in an action situation (Ostrom and Polski, 22). The European Union strives to consolidate resources to help countries achieve projects that they might not otherwise be capable of completing on their own (“Factcheck on the EU Budget”). While not directly stated, it is also likely that the European Union strives to accommodate the goals of all member states because the organization includes leaders from all of the EU countries. When it comes to natural gas allocation, the E.U. Commissioners seek to provide E.U.-wide energy security in the wake of the Russian invasion of Ukraine (Lynch and Von Der Burchard).

Sometimes the E.U. 's desire to provide energy security for all member states conflicts with Germany's domestic policy needs. For example, the European Union wanted to institute an E.U.-wide price cap on natural gas (Lynch and Von der Burchard). However, Germany opposed this idea because the country feared that gas providers would sell to different markets if European markets were only able to pay them a subset of the true cost (Von der Burchard). Therefore, instead of waiting for an E.U.-wide price cap, Germany decided to pass a price brake - meaning that Germany set a price cap for consumers but then also paid natural gas providers the difference (Von der Burchard). Germany paid for this project through its 200 billion Euro relief plan (Von der Burchard).

Italian Commissioner Paolo Gentiloni and French Commissioner Thierry Breton criticized Chancellor Scholz' 200 billion Euro relief package because they believe it will unfairly advantage German gas providers over other E.U. gas providers, such as those in Italy or France (Lynch and Von Der Burchard). Gentiloni and Breton suggest that the E.U. pass a continent-wide price cap to address the energy crisis instead of allowing each nation to pass its own legislation (Lynch and Von Der Burchard). While E.U. Commission members are supposed to support the goals of the entire E.U. over the views of their home country, it seems like Gentiloni and Breton may be concerned for their home countries, causing them to oppose German legislation. It is important to analyze the valuations of E.U. Commission members because the E.U. Commission proposes legislation that will affect German energy policy, so if the E.U. is not prioritizing German interests, it is up to the German government to do so.

German Chancellor Olaf Scholz seeks to create legislation that specifically meets the needs of German citizens (Hill). Many citizens in East Germany value economic stability over solidarity with Ukraine. For example, in the Eastern German state of Thuringia, over 30,000 far-right protestors marched in early September to call for an end of sanctions against Russia and the reopening of the Nord Stream pipelines ("Thousands March"). To meet the needs of this subset of the German population, Scholz passed his 200 billion Euro relief bill that helped consumers pay for rising energy prices (Hill). His efforts effectively garnered support from East Germany, which is evident in East German elections, like the October 2022 Saxony election, in which Scholz' Social Democratic Party won (Chazan).

Many German communities call on the government to prioritize climate action. Protesters call for a quick transition to renewable energy and away from fossil fuels (Barigazzi). In response to environmental pleas, the German government in June pledged to supply 80% of

Germany electricity from renewable sources by 2030 (“Germany introduces”), and in November, 2022, Scholz said that accelerating the transition to renewable energy is one the German government’s main goals (“The future belongs to wind power”). To meet its climate goals, the government plans to repurpose 33,000 acres of mining land to house 1,000 megawatts of solar power (“Germany’s Leag”).

Chancellor Scholz’ desire to meet the needs of the German people likely stems from his desire to be reelected. As previously mentioned, German citizens elect the parliament, members of which approve the Federal Chancellor. Scholz’ approval ratings are at an all-time low since he took office in December, 2021 (Hill). His lowest ratings are found in predominantly far right-wing states in East German states, like Saxony and Thuringia, so his relief packages may be aimed at addressing East Germans’ energy price complaints (Hill). Similarly, Scholz’ environmental action also boosts his chances of re-election, especially in West Germany, where environmental values dominate (“Green ministers outshine Scholz”).

Robert Habeck, the Minister of the German Ministry of Economic Affairs and Climate Action, also values meeting the needs of the German people. Habeck is a member of the Green Party, who prioritize environmental action (“Green ministers outshine Scholz”). Habeck incorporates Green Party ideas into ministry values. For example, the German Ministry of Economic Affairs and Climate Action set goals of reconstructing Germany’s energy landscape to focus on renewable energy (“The Energy Transition”). Like Chancellor Scholz, Minister Habeck wants to meet the needs of German citizens, and his motivation for doing so could be related to his desire to gain voter support.

Actors: Capital Resources

The European Union is funded through taxes from member states, through direct donations from member states, and through “customs duties:” taxes collected when products are

transferred between nations through direct donations from member states (“Revenue”; “Customs Duty Information”).

The current European energy crisis sparked by the Russian Invasion of Ukraine requires the E.U. to spend more money to stabilize the economy. For example, the European Union REPowerEU plan requires the E.U. to raise an additional 210 billion Euros between now and 2027 (“REPowerEU”). The E.U. will sell its Emission Trading System allowances to raise this money (“REPowerEU”), but it is unclear whether this source of revenue will be enough to cover the costs of new E.U. energy legislation.

Germany is funded through tax revenue, and taxes are collected on a national, state, and local level (“Economy of Germany”). While taxes have been a sufficient funding tool in the past, the current tax rate is insufficient to cover Germany’s increased spending (Tagliapietra). Therefore, as of September, 2022, Germany has raised taxes on energy companies that have gained unusually large profits from rising energy costs, otherwise known as “windfall profits” (“Germany agrees”). Germany has also allocated funds from previous projects to cover its new relief bills. For example, a portion of the 200 billion Euro relief bill proposed by Scholz would be financed through unused funds that were originally allocated to bail out Lufthansa Airlines during the height of the Covid-19 pandemic (Hansen).

It is important to note that Germany’s total annual budget is larger than the European Union’s total annual budget. Accounting for yearly fluctuations, the European Union’s annual budget is expected to hover between 160 - 180 billion Euro’s between 2021-2027, while Germany’s annual budget for 2022 was 457.6 billion Euros (“Factcheck on the EU budget”; “Investing in the future”). Germany has the largest economy in the E.U. (see Figure 1), so Germany’s large budget allows the nation to pass large relief plans, like the 200 billion Euro

relief plan, that the European Union and other countries do not have the funds to pass (“List of European Countries by GDP”).

6. Analyze patterns of interaction

Information Flows: between the EU and Germany

Regulation EU 2017/1938 establishes rules for information flows between contracting parties and the Energy Community Secretariat. For example, Regulation EU 2017/1938 requires contracting parties to choose a certain ministry to implement the natural gas crisis plan and then report back to the Energy Community (Regulation EU 2017/1938, 645). Regulation EU 2017/1938 also requires that each contracting party establish “protected customers” and report annual gas consumption volumes of protected customers to the Energy Community (Regulation EU 2017/1938, 648). This information must be relayed to the Energy Community Secretariat, and once that is done, the Secretariat assesses the plan and ensures that it complies with Energy Community law (Regulation EU 2017/1938, 652). The Energy Community can then amend or suggest alterations to the contracting party’s natural gas crisis plan (Regulation EU 2017/1938, 660).

Regulation EU 2017/1938 not only establishes information rules for the *design* of a domestic natural gas crisis plan, but it also establishes information rules for the *implementation* of a domestic natural gas crisis plan. If a contracting party declares one of the crisis levels, they are required to notify the Energy Community Secretariat and other contracting parties that might be affected (European EU 2017/1938, 657). Throughout the crisis, the contracting party must report on daily gas demand and supply, daily flow of gas across the borders of the nation in question, and the expected duration that the contracting party can supply gas to its protected customers (European EU 2017/1938, 659). As evidenced, Regulation EU 2017/1938 outlines

clear rules for information flow between the European Union and Germany, by which Germany must abide.

Following the Regulation EU 2017/1938 guidelines, Germany selected the German Federal Ministry of Economic Affairs and Climate Action to implement the E.U. natural gas crisis plan in Germany (Hansen and Knolle). Germany has decided to treat private households and small-medium sized companies as “protected customers” (“Factbox: Germany’s measures”).

Information Flow: within Germany

Within Germany, information about natural gas levels is communicated by the German gas transmission system operators, and this information influences domestic natural gas policy. For example, a month after the exogenous shock of the Russian invasion of Ukraine, German gas transmission system operators (TSO's) in February, 2022, reported that supplies were dangerously low (“Factbox: The three stages”). In response to this report, Germany entered phase 1 of its emergency crisis plan in March, 2022, (“Germany enters Phase 2 of Emergency Gas Plan”).

7. Analyze outcomes

Distributional Equity

Distributional means that individuals only pay for what they can afford (Ostrom and Polski, 26). Many Germans cannot afford to pay for energy. The Institute of the German Economy considers anyone who spends over 10% of their income on energy to be living below the energy poverty line, and currently one quarter of Germans live below the energy poverty line (Kedzierski et al.). To help German citizens pay for energy, Germany created natural gas relief plans that directly help the most vulnerable households and businesses (“Tangible relief”). For example, Germany created a heating subsidy for households who are already receiving a rent

subsidy (“Tangible relief”). The heating subsidy, which is the largest housing benefit in Germany’s history, will be enacted in January, 2023 (“Germany stands united”).

Adaptability and Sustainability

Germany’s policies will likely prove to be sustainable - that is, they will endure over long periods of time - because Germany has the funds to follow through on its proposals.

Additionally, the Scholz administration seems to be receptive to public opinion, as evidenced by the way Scholz heeded economic and environmental grievances when making policy decisions. Therefore, even though Scholz’ ratings are currently low, he might be able to win over more votes like he did in Saxony, giving him a chance for reelection in 2026. The continuity of leadership would likely make the current legislation more sustainable (“Election of the Federal President”).

As for adaptability, Germany is mandated to create a three-phase crisis plan by EU 2017/1938, so Germany will not be able to change its crisis stages unless the E.U. updates its natural gas crisis plan. Germany can adapt through changing domestic policies, though. Likely ways that Germany will change its plans include adjusting for winter, when more natural gas is needed, or continuing to search for sources of natural gas, such as those in Senegal, as the War in Ukraine continues.

One consideration for the sustainability of Germany’s 200 billion Euro relief plan is that while it assuages citizens’ immediate energy needs, it does not reduce natural gas demand or consumption (“Germany girds for gas supply pain”). Therefore, Germany will likely need to continue to acquire and construct other sources of energy, like solar panels in which they have recently invested.

Concluding Thoughts

As evidenced through the Institutional Analysis and Development Framework, German natural gas policy is governed through a complex system of polycentric governance. Both the European Union and German legislation affect natural gas allocation in Germany, but the two regulating bodies have different valuations - the E.U. wants to provide continent-wide stability, whereas Germany wants to meet the specific needs of its citizens. Since Germany's valuations differ from the E.U.'s valuations, Germany has to supplement E.U. policy by passing domestic natural gas policy. This is evident in how Germany amended phase 2 in REGULATION (EU) 2017/1938 to pass a "solidarity levy" instead of rising energy prices for consumers. Germany's need to supplement E.U. policy is also evident in its 200 billion Euro price brake. While this plan was not widely supported by certain members of the European Union Commission, it was necessary to help German citizens pay for electricity. Luckily, Germany is able to supplement E.U. policy so readily due to its large budget.

Figure 1: GDP of European Countries for 2020 and 2021 (“List of European Countries by GDP”)

Country/Economy	GDP (Nominal)						
	2020	2021	Change	Europe	World	Europe	World
Germany	3,843.340	4,230.170	386.830	17.9	4.46	1	4
United Kingdom	2,709.680	3,108.420	398.740	13.2	3.27	2	5
France	2,624.420	2,940.430	316.010	12.5	3.10	3	7
Italy	1,884.940	2,120.230	235.290	8.99	2.23	4	8
Russia	1,478.570	1,647.570	169.000	6.98	1.74	5	11
Spain	1,280.460	1,439.960	159.500	6.10	1.52	6	14
Netherlands	913.134	1,007.560	94.426	4.27	1.06	7	18
Switzerland	751.877	810.830	58.953	3.44	0.854	8	20
Poland	595.916	655.332	59.416	2.78	0.690	9	23
Sweden	541.064	622.365	81.301	2.64	0.656	10	24
Belgium	514.920	581.848	66.928	2.47	0.613	11	25
Ireland	425.549	516.253	90.704	2.19	0.544	12	27
Austria	432.524	481.209	48.685	2.04	0.507	13	28
Norway	362.522	445.507	82.985	1.89	0.469	14	32
Denmark	356.085	396.666	40.581	1.68	0.418	15	35
Finland	269.557	296.016	26.459	1.25	0.312	16	45
Romania	248.716	287.279	38.563	1.22	0.303	17	47
Czech Republic	245.349	276.914	31.565	1.17	0.292	18	48
Portugal	228.356	251.709	23.353	1.07	0.265	19	49
Greece	189.259	211.645	22.386	0.897	0.223	20	52
Ukraine	155.300	181.038	25.738	0.767	0.191	21	55
Hungary	155.013	180.959	25.946	0.767	0.191	22	56
Slovak Republic	104.491	116.748	12.257	0.495	0.123	23	61
Luxembourg	73.205	83.771	10.566	0.355	0.0882	24	67
Bulgaria	69.209	77.907	8.698	0.330	0.0821	25	71
Belarus	60.201	65.754	5.553	0.279	0.0693	26	77
Croatia	56.171	63.399	7.228	0.269	0.0668	27	79
Lithuania	55.843	62.635	6.792	0.265	0.0660	28	80

Works Cited:

- Abnett, Kate. "EU asks countries to cut gas demand by 15% until spring." *Reuters*, 20 July, 2022, <https://www.reuters.com/business/energy/bracing-russian-gas-cuts-eu-readies-plan-cut-demand-2022-07-20/>. Accessed 25 October, 2022.
- Abnett, Kate. "Germany wants EU to work with countries on new gas fields." *Reuters*, 20 October, 2022, <https://www.reuters.com/business/energy/germany-wants-eu-work-with-countries-new-gas-fields-document-2022-10-20/>. Accessed 11 November, 2022.
- "Amount contributed to the budget of the European Union in 2020, by member state." *Statistica*, <https://www.statista.com/statistics/316691/eu-budget-contributions-by-country/>. Accessed 8 December, 2022.
- Anderies, John M. and Janssen, Marco A. "Sustaining the Commons." *Center for Behavior, Institutions, and the Environment, Arizona State University*, Version 2.0, 2016, <http://sustainingthecommons.asu.edu>. Accessed 25 October, 2022.
- "Customs Duty Information." *U.S. Customs and Border Protection*, 27 January, 2021, <https://www.cbp.gov/travel/international-visitors/kbyg/customs-duty-info>. Accessed 8 December, 2022.
- Chazan, Guy. "Social Democrats win Lower Saxony election." *Financial Times*, 10 October, 2022, <https://www.ft.com/content/823cf853-421c-4ba7-ab21-ef786c091de4>. Accessed 8 October, 2022.
- "Commission adopts its Work Programme for 2023: Tackling the most pressing challenges, while staying the course for the long term." *European Commission*, 18 October, 2022, https://ec.europa.eu/commission/presscorner/detail/en/IP_22_6224. Accessed 15 November, 2022.

“Communication from the Commission to the European Parliament, the European Council, the Council, the European Economic and Social Committee, and the Committee of the Regions REPowerEU plan.” *EUR-Lex*, 5 May, 2022, <https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/TXT/?uri=COM%3A2022%3A230%3AFIN&qid=1653033742483>.

Accessed 15 November, 2022.

“Council of the European Union.” *European Union*, https://european-union.europa.eu/institutions-law-budget/institutions-and-bodies/institutions-and-bodies-profiles/council-european-union_en#:~:text=There%20are%20no%20fixed%20members,responsible%20for%20that%20policy%20area. Accessed 15 November, 2022.

“Dr. Robert Habeck: Federal Minister for Economic Affairs and Climate Action.”

Federal Ministry for Economic Affairs and Climate Action,
<https://www.bmwk.de/Redaktion/EN/Artikel/Curriculum-Vitae/curriculum-vitae-habeck.html>. Accessed 25 October, 2022.

“Economy of Germany.” *Britannica*, <https://www.britannica.com/place/Germany/The-East-German-system>. Accessed 15 November, 2022.

“Election of the Federal President.” *Der Bundespräsident*,
<https://www.bundespraesident.de/EN/Role-and-Functions/ConstitutionalBasis/Election-of-the-Federal-President/Elections-node.html>. Accessed 8 December, 2022.

“Energy Community.” *European Commission*,
<https://energy.ec.europa.eu/topics/international-cooperation/international-organisations-and-initiatives/energy>

community_en#:~:text=The%20Energy%20Community%20is%20an,known%20as%20the%20contracting%20parties. Accessed 8 December, 2022.

“Energy poverty increasingly affecting Germany’s middle class.” *Journalism for the energy transition*, 4 July, 2022, <https://www.cleanenergywire.org/news/energy-poverty-increasingly-affecting-germanys-middle-class-analysis>. Accessed 15 November, 2022.

“European Commission.” *Citizens Information*, 21 June, 2022, https://www.citizensinformation.ie/en/government_in_ireland/european_government/eu_institutions/european_commission.html#:~:text=Each%20member%20state%20nominates%20a,do%20not%20represent%20their%20countries. Accessed 25 October, 2022.

“European Commission.” *European Union*, https://european-union.europa.eu/institutions-law-budget/institutions-and-bodies/institutions-and-bodies-profiles/european-commission_en. Accessed 25 October, 2022.

“European Council Conclusions, 20-21 October, 2022.” *European Council*, <https://www.consilium.europa.eu/en/press/press-releases/2022/10/21/european-council-conclusions-20-21-october-2022/>. Accessed 11 November, 2022.

“European Council Conclusions, 20-21 October, 2022.” *European Council*, <https://www.consilium.europa.eu/en/press/press-releases/2022/10/21/european-council-conclusions-20-21-october-2022/>. Accessed 11 November, 2022.

“Election of Members of the German Bundestag.” *Deutscher Bundestag*, https://www.bundestag.de/en/parliament/elections/election_mp-245694. Accessed 25 October, 2022.

“Election of the Federal Chancellor.” *Deutscher Bundestag*,

<https://www.bundestag.de/en/parliament/function/chancellor>. Accessed 25 October, 2022.

“European Parliament.” *European Union*, https://european-union.europa.eu/institutions-law-budget/institutions-and-bodies/institutions-and-bodies-profiles/european-parliament_en. Accessed 15 November, 2022.

“The Energy Transition.” *Federal Ministry for Economic Affairs and Climate Action*, <https://www.bmwk.de/Navigation/EN/Home/home.html>. Accessed 15 November, 2022.

“Factbox: Germany’s measures to protect consumers from rising energy prices.” *Reuters*, 29 September, 2022, <https://www.reuters.com/business/energy/germanys-measures-protect-consumers-rising-energy-prices-2022-09-29/>. Accessed 15 November, 2022.

“Factbox: The three stages of Germany’s emergency gas plan.” *Reuters*, 10 July, 2022, <https://www.reuters.com/business/energy/three-stages-germanys-emergency-gas-plan-2022-07-10/>. Accessed 25 October, 2022.

“Factcheck on the EU budget.” *European Union*, September, 2022, <https://ec.europa.eu/budget/publications/fact-check/index.html>. Accessed 8 December, 2022.

“Germany agrees on €65 billion relief package.” *DW*, 4 September, 2022, <https://www.dw.com/en/germanys-government-agrees-on-65-billion-relief-package-amid-soaring-energy-prices/a-63013937>. Accessed 15 November, 2022.

“German elections and expat voting rights.” *I am expat*, <https://www.iamexpat.de/expat-info/official-issues/elections-voting-rights-expats-germany>. Accessed 8 December, 2022.

“Germany enters Phase 2 of Emergency Gas Plan.” *Reuters*, 23 June, 2022,
<https://www.reuters.com/markets/europe/germanys-network-regulator-will-not-trigger-price-adjustment-clause-gas-plan-2022-06-23/>. Accessed 25 October, 2022.

“Germany girds for gas supply pain, targets \$93 billion price relief plan.” *Energy world*,
11 October, 2022,
<https://energy.economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/oil-and-gas/germany-girds-for-gas-supply-pain-targets-93-billion-price-relief-plan/94773277>. Accessed 8 December, 2022.

“Germany introduces steps to boost renewable energy expansion.” *Reuters*, 6 September, 2022, <https://www.reuters.com/business/energy/germany-introduces-steps-boost-renewable-energy-expansion-2022-09-06/>. Accessed 8 December, 2022.

“Germany’s Leag eyes 1,000 MW solar park in renewables expansion.” *Reuters*, 29 September, 2022, <https://www.reuters.com/business/energy/germanys-leag-eyes-1000-mw-solar-park-renewables-expansion-2022-09-29/>. Accessed 8 December, 2022.

“Green ministers outshine Scholz as stars of German government.” *France 24*, 19 May, 2022, <https://www.france24.com/en/live-news/20220519-green-ministers-outshine-scholz-as-stars-of-german-government>. Accessed 8 December, 2022.

“Germany plans gas levy on consumers amid energy crisis.” *DW*, 28 July, 2022,
<https://www.dw.com/en/germany-plans-gas-levy-on-consumers-as-russia-turns-down-supply/a-62624974>. Accessed 25 October, 2022.

“Germany stands united at this challenging time.” *The Federal Government*, 5 September, 2022, <https://www.bundesregierung.de/breg-en/news/third-relief-package-2123130>. Accessed 15 November, 2022.

“Germany wants EU to work with countries on new gas fields.” *Reuters*, 20 October, 2022, <https://www.reuters.com/business/energy/germany-wants-eu-work-with-countries-new-gas-fields-document-2022-10-20/>. Accessed 15 November, 2022.

Hansen, Holger. 10 October, 2022. “Germany girds for gas supply pain, targets \$93 billion price relief plan.” *Reuters*,

Hansen, Holger and Knolle, Kirsti. “Germany agrees 200 bln euro package to shield against surging energy prices.” *Reuters*, September 29, 2022.

<https://www.reuters.com/business/energy/german-govt-agrees-relief-package-response-soaring-energy-prices-sources-2022-09-29/>. Accessed 15 November, 2022.

Hill, Jenny. “Ukraine war: Germany to cover energy bills as gas prices soar.” *BBC News*, Dresden, 2 December, 2022, <https://www.bbc.com/news/world-europe-63814656>.

Accessed 8 December, 2022.

“How priorities are set.” *European Commission*,

https://ec.europa.eu/info/strategy/priorities-and-goals/how-priorities-are-set_en.

Accessed 15 November, 2022.

“Investing in the future and securing stability.” *The German Federal Government*, 16 March 2022, <https://www.bundesregierung.de/breg-en/news/cabinet-federal-budget-2022-2016888>. Accessed 8 December, 2022.

Kedzierski, Michal, Plociennik Sebastian, and Frymark Kamil. “Germany: third relief package for the energy crisis,” 19 September, 2022.

<https://www.osw.waw.pl/en/publikacje/analyses/2022-09-19/germany-third-relief-package-energy-crisis>. Accessed 15 November, 2022.

“Legislative Powers.” *About Parliament, European Parliament.*

<https://www.europarl.europa.eu/about-parliament/en/powers-and-procedures/legislative-powers>. Accessed 15 November, 2022.

“List of European Countries by GDP.” *Statistics Times*, 2 November, 2021,

<https://statisticstimes.com/economy/european-countries-by-gdp.php#:~:text=Germany%20is%20the%20largest%20economy,economies%20represent%20almost%2080%25%20share>. Accessed 8 December, 2022.

Lynch, Suzanne and Von Der Burchard, Hans. “Scholz’ ‘Germany First’ energy plan fires Franco-Italian revolt in Brussels,” *Politico*, 4 October, 2022,

<https://www.politico.eu/article/scholzs-germany-first-energy-plan-fires-franco-italian-revolt-in-brussels/>. 8 December, 2022.

Moll, Benjamin. “What if Germany is cut off from Russian oil and gas?” *LSE*, 23 March, 2022, <https://blogs.lse.ac.uk/businessreview/2022/03/23/what-if-germany-is-cut-off-from-russian-oil-and-gas/>. Accessed 25 October, 2022.

Ostrom, Elinor, and Polski, Margaret. “An Institutional Framework for Policy Analysis and Design,” 15 June, 1999, pp. 26.

“Recovery and Resilience Facility.” *European Commission*,

https://ec.europa.eu/info/business-economy-euro/recovery-coronavirus/recovery-and-resilience-facility_en#the-recovery-and-resilience-facility. Accessed 15 November, 2022.

“REPowerEU: A plan to rapidly reduce dependence on Russian fossil fuels and fast forward the green transition.” *European Commission*, 18 May, 2022,

https://ec.europa.eu/commission/presscorner/detail/en/IP_22_3131. Accessed 15 November, 2022.

“REGULATION (EU) 2017/1938 of 25 October 2017 concerning measures to safeguard the security of gas supply.” *PART II ACQUIS COMMUNAUTAIRE / SECURITY OF SUPPLY*, adapted by Ministerial Council Decision 2021/15/MC-EnC, pp. 643-684, https://www.google.com/url?q=https://www.energy-community.org/dam/jcr:7af0171c-ddc8-4788-a97b-c9ad4d703a99/REGULATION_EU_2017_1938.pdf&sa=D&source=docs&ust=1666569064777670&usg=AOvVaw0k83xsf60b8tKLJsJYtufs. Accessed 23 October, 2022.

“Revenue.” *European Union*, https://european-union.europa.eu/institutions-law-budget/budget/revenue_en#:~:text=The%20EU%27s%20sources%20of%20income,to%20comply%20with%20EU%20rules. Accessed 15 November, 2022.

“Structure and tasks.” *The Federal Government*, <https://www.bundesregierung.de/bregen/federal-government/structure-and-tasks-470508>. Accessed 25 October, 2022.

Steitz, Christoph. “Germany hands \$15 bln bailout to Uniper after Russian gas hit.” *Reuters*, 22 July, 2022, <https://www.reuters.com/markets/deals/germanys-uniper-gets-15-blن-eur-state-bail-out-avert-collapse-2022-07-22/>. Accessed 25 October, 2022.

Stuart, Elliot. “Germany Moves to Second Level of Emergency Gas plan: Ministry.” *S&P Global Commodity Insights*, edited by Alisdair Bowles, 23 June, 2022, <https://www.spglobal.com/commodityinsights/en/market-insights/latest-news/natural-gas/062322-germany-moves-to-second-level-of-emergency-gas-plan-ministry>. Accessed 25 October, 2022.

Tagliapietra, S. “REPowerEU: will EU countries really make it work?” *Bruegel Blog*, 18 May 2022, <https://www.bruegel.org/blog-post/repowereu-will-eu-countries-really-make-it-work>. Accessed 15 November, 2022.

“Tangible relief for citizens.” *The Federal Government*. 2 November, 2022,

<https://www.bundesregierung.de/breg-en/news/federal-laender-consultations-2139802>.

Accessed 15 November, 2022.

“The Commissioners.” *European Commission*,

https://ec.europa.eu/commission/commissioners/2019-2024_en. Accessed 15 November,

2022.

“The European Commission’s priorities” *European Commission*,

https://ec.europa.eu/info/strategy/priorities-2019-2024_en. Accessed 15 November, 2022.

“The future belongs to wind power, solar energy and green hydrogen.” *Die*

Bundesregierung, 7 November, 2022, [https://www.bundesregierung.de/breg-](https://www.bundesregierung.de/breg-de/aktuelles/climate-change-conference-in-egypt-2140502)

[de/aktuelles/climate-change-conference-in-egypt-2140502](https://www.bundesregierung.de/breg-de/aktuelles/climate-change-conference-in-egypt-2140502).

“Utility Decoupling: Montana Utility Pros and Cons.” *Montana State Legislature*,

January 2018, pp. 2, [https://leg.mt.gov/content/Committees/Interim/2017-2018/Energy-](https://leg.mt.gov/content/Committees/Interim/2017-2018/Energy-and-Telecommunications/Meetings/Jan-)

[and-Telecommunications/Meetings/Jan-](https://leg.mt.gov/content/Committees/Interim/2017-2018/Energy-and-Telecommunications/Meetings/Jan-)

[2018/Exhibits/Decoupling/Jan18UtilityDecouplingPerspectives.pdf](https://leg.mt.gov/content/Committees/Interim/2017-2018/Energy-and-Telecommunications/Meetings/Jan-). Accessed 15

November, 2022.

Von der Burchard, Hans. “Germany opposes EU price cap on all gas imports,” *Politico*,

30 September, 2022, <https://www.politico.eu/article/germany-oppose-eu-gas-price-cap-domestic-price-limit/>. Accessed 8 December, 2022.